AI-03642 Retirement Engine Three-Bucket Strategy

Owner	Ⓡ Rigel Arcayan
Tags	Investing
Created time	April 4, 2026 9:00 AM

Executive Summary: The Three-Bucket Strategy

Instead of viewing $2 million as a single pile of money, Camp suggests dividing it into three distinct "jobs" based on tax treatment and timeline.

1. The Taxable Brokerage Account ($500k)

- **The Job:** The "Early Retirement Bridge" (Ages 55–60+).
- **Strategy:** Use this first because there are no age-based withdrawal penalties.
- **Investments:** Tax-efficient stock index ETFs and low-turnover investments that generate qualified dividends and long-term capital gains.
- **Goal:** Fund lifestyle and travel while keeping IRA withdrawals low to manage tax brackets and health insurance (ACA) subsidies.

2. The Pre-Tax IRA/401(k) ($1.1M)

- **The Job:** The "Controlled Income Engine" (Ages 60–72+).
- **Strategy:** Initially, let this grow or use it for "Roth Conversions" during low-income years to reduce future Required Minimum Distributions (RMDs).
- **Investments:** Higher concentration of bonds, income-oriented assets, and dividend stocks. Since rebalancing here is tax-free, it's the place for more conservative, stable holdings.

- **Goal:** Smooth out future taxes so RMDs don't "detonate" your tax bill later in life.

3. The Roth IRA ($400k)

- **The Job:** "Long-Term Growth & Flexibility" (Age 70+ and Legacy).
- **Strategy:** Leave this alone as long as possible. It is a "lever" for large, lumpy expenses (like a new roof or medical emergency) because withdrawals are tax-free.
- **Investments:** Aggressive, broad equity exposure. Since growth is never taxed, you want your highest-returning assets here.
- **Goal:** Maximize tax-free growth and provide a tax-free inheritance for heirs.

Retirement Phases and Asset Allocation

Camp argues that asset allocation should be **dynamic**, shifting through three "risk windows":

Phase	Years	Risk Level	Allocation Strategy
1. The Fragile Years	Early 50s–60s	**High**	50–70% Stocks. Focus on protecting against "Sequence of Returns" risk (market drops early in retirement).
2. The Steady Years	Mid 60s–70s	**Moderate**	60–80% Stocks. Once Social Security kicks in, the portfolio does less "heavy lifting," allowing for more growth.
3. The Later Years	70s and Beyond	**Variable**	Allocation depends on health and legacy goals. Risk may actually *increase* if investing primarily for heirs.

Key Takeaways for Early Retirees

- **Avoid the "Magic Number" Trap:** Having $2 million on paper is different from having $2 million in spendable, after-tax cash.

- **Sequence Matters:** How you move money between accounts (Taxable $\rightarrow$ IRA $\rightarrow$ Roth) determines if you stay "portfolio rich but spending poor."
- **Asset Location:** Put tax-efficient growth in taxable accounts, bonds in IRAs, and high-growth equities in Roth IRAs.
- **Plan for "Cliffs":** Always look ahead for milestones like Social Security starts, Medicare premiums (IRMAA), and RMDs.

> **The Bottom Line:** A successful $2 million retirement is built on a year-by-year map that treats your portfolio like a paycheck, not a random collection of investments.

Executive Summary: The "Boring" Strategy for Tax-Efficient Retirement

Most retirees focus on **Asset Allocation** (what you own), but the most successful focus on **Asset Location** (where you own it). Chasing high-dividend portfolios and "living off the interest" feels safe, but it often creates an expensive, uncontrollable tax bill. The goal of a high-performance portfolio isn't to maximize income—it’s to **maximize after-tax spending power.**

The Core Problem: The "Income" Trap

Many retirees load their taxable brokerage accounts with dividend ETFs, bond funds, and covered-call strategies to recreate a "paycheck."

- **The Downside:** These investments trigger automatic taxes (often at high ordinary income rates) every year, regardless of whether you need the cash.
- **Loss of Control:** You cannot choose the timing or amount of this income, which can inadvertently push you into higher tax brackets or increase Medicare premiums.

The Solution: Strategic Asset Location

To keep more of what your portfolio makes, you must match the right investment to the right tax environment:

Account Type	Tax Treatment	Ideal Assets
Taxable Brokerage	Taxed on dividends/interest annually; capital gains only when sold.	**Broad Index Funds.** Low turnover; growth is only taxed when *you* decide to sell.
Pre-Tax (401k/IRA)	Tax-deferred growth; withdrawals taxed as ordinary income.	**Bonds & Income Funds.** Interest compounds tax-free until withdrawal.
Tax-Free (Roth)	Tax-free growth and withdrawals.	**High-Growth Equities.** Best for your longest-runway, highest-appreciation assets.

Key Concept: "Create Your Own Dividend"

Instead of owning a fund that forces a taxable payment on you, focus on **Total Return** (price growth + income).

- **The Strategy:** When you need cash, manually sell shares of your growth investments.
- **The Benefit:** You choose which "tax lots" to sell to minimize gains, and you control the exact timing of the income. This flexibility is a massive lever for managing your overall tax liability in retirement.

Cleaned Transcript Highlights

1. Income vs. Control

"Income is not the same thing as control. A portfolio built specifically around generating income can create tax bills you did not choose, at amounts you didn't choose, at times you didn't choose... The goal is to maximize after-tax spending power."

2. The Common Mistake (The "Tom and Linda" Case)

- **The Error:** Holding bond funds and high-yield covered-call ETFs in a taxable brokerage account.

- **The Result:** Paying ordinary income tax (the same rate as a paycheck) on interest every year, even if the money isn't being spent.
- **The Fix:** Move income-heavy assets (Bonds) into tax-deferred accounts (IRA/401k) and move growth assets (Index Funds) into the Brokerage or Roth.

3. Why Asset Location Works

"In a taxable account, you have the ability to control when you recognize gains, but only if you're not undermining that control by holding investments that kick off automatic income regardless of what you do."

4. The Final Framework

"A dividend strategy in taxable gives you income on the fund's schedule. Creating your own dividend gives you income on yours. That flexibility lets you manage your bracket, your Medicare premiums, and your health insurance credits."

Note: This strategy is designed to make retirement "cheaper to run" by reducing the friction of unnecessary taxation.

Explain more on the "principal as a retirement income engine" for compounding. What is a good target $$ number to aim when planning for stable retirement.

To understand the "principal as a retirement income engine," we have to shift the perspective from **accumulation** (stacking money) to **utility** (how that money moves).

In a high-performance retirement, your principal isn't just a "savings account"; it is a set of distinct engines working at different speeds to combat inflation, taxes, and longevity risk.

---

1. The Mechanics: Principal as an Income Engine

Think of your principal as a **three-stage turbine**. Each stage has a specific job to ensure the engine never stalls.

Stage A: The Cash/Liquidity Buffer (0–2 Years of Expenses)

- **The Job:** To prevent "Sequence of Returns Risk" (selling your stocks when the market is down).
- **The Engine:** High-yield savings, money markets, or short-term CDs.
- **Compounding:** Low. This isn't for growth; it’s for sleep-adjusted-return.

Stage B: The Total Return Core (The "Workhorse")

- **The Job:** To outpace inflation. This is where the **"Create Your Own Dividend"** strategy lives.
- **The Engine:** Low-cost, broad-market index ETFs.
- **Compounding:** High. By not "skimming" dividends automatically in taxable accounts, the full value of the shares compounds. When you need income, you "harvest" only what you need, leaving the rest of the engine intact.

Stage C: The Longevity Insurance (The "Turbo")

- **The Job:** To provide for your 80s and 90s.
- **The Engine:** Roth IRAs or aggressive growth equities.
- **Compounding:** Maximum. Because these are the last assets you touch, they have the longest runway to double and quadruple over 20–30 years.

---

2. Calculating Your Target Number

There is no "universal" number because everyone’s "burn rate" (expenses) is different. However, the industry standard for a "stable" retirement is based on the **25x Rule**.

The 25x Rule (Based on the 4% Safe Withdrawal Rate)

To find your target, determine your desired annual spend and multiply it by 25.

Annual Desired Spending	Target Portfolio (25x)	Monthly Pre-Tax Income
$60,000	$1.5 Million	$5,000
$100,000	$2.5 Million	$8,333
$150,000	$3.75 Million	$12,500

$200,000	$5.0 Million	$16,666

Why this works:

This math assumes a **4% withdrawal rate**. If your portfolio earns an average of **7%** (historical stock market average) and inflation is **3%**, your "real" growth is **4%**. By withdrawing exactly 4%, your principal remains theoretically "immortal"—it keeps up with inflation without ever being depleted.

---

3. The "Antifragile" Adjustment

A "stable" retirement isn't just about reaching a number; it's about the **floor** and the **ceiling**.

- **The Floor:** Ensure your "fixed" expenses (housing, food, basic healthcare) are covered by "guaranteed" income (Social Security, Pensions, or a small Annuity).
- **The Ceiling:** Your portfolio principal covers your "discretionary" life (travel, hobbies, gifting).

How to calculate your personal "Stable" Number:

1. **Estimate Annual Expenses:** (e.g., $120,000).
2. **Subtract Guaranteed Income:** (e.g., -$40,000 from Social Security).
3. **Find the Gap:** ($80,000).
4. **Apply the 25x Multiplier:** $80,000 × 25 = **$2.0 Million**.

This is the amount of invested principal you need to sustain your lifestyle indefinitely without "identity drift" or financial anxiety.

What does your current "annual spend" look like, and have you factored in how much of that will be covered by Social Security or other fixed sources?

22-Point Guidelines for a High-Performance Retirement Protocol

The Philosophy of Control

1. **Prioritize After-Tax Power:** The goal isn't the highest gross return; it's the highest amount of spendable cash after the IRS takes its cut.
2. **Income vs. Control:** Recognize that automatic dividends are "forced" income. Real security comes from choosing *when* to recognize gains.
3. **The "Boring" Advantage:** High-performance strategies often look unremarkable (index funds and tax location) rather than complex or "exciting" (active trading/high yield).
4. **Total Return Mindset:** Evaluate success based on price appreciation plus dividends combined (

   $$Growth + Income$$

   ), not just the yield percentage.

Asset Location Strategy

1. **Taxable Placement:** Reserve brokerage accounts for low-turnover broad index ETFs to minimize annual tax drag.
2. **Pre-Tax Placement:** Use Traditional IRAs/401ks for bonds and high-turnover assets where interest can compound without immediate taxation.
3. **Roth Placement:** Dedicate the Roth "shelter" to your highest-growth equity assets; this is your longest-runway capital.
4. **Avoid "Tax Leakage":** Never place bond funds or covered-call strategies in a taxable account unless the tax cost is outweighed by a specific, immediate cash need.
5. **The Custom Dividend:** "Create your own dividend" by selling shares intentionally. This allows you to select specific tax lots to minimize realized gains.

The Financial Engine

1. **The 25x Anchor:** Use 25 times your annual "gap" (expenses minus guaranteed income) as your baseline target for a stable retirement.
2. **The 4% Guardrail:** Use the 4% withdrawal rate as a starting rule of thumb, adjusting based on market conditions and longevity.

3. **Sequence Risk Mitigation:** Maintain a 1–2 year cash/liquidity buffer to avoid selling equities during a market downturn.
4. **Principal Preservation:** View your principal as an "immortal" engine that remains intact by only withdrawing the "real" growth (Total Return minus Inflation).
5. **The Three-Bucket Turbine:** Organize assets into Liquidity (0-2 years), Core Growth (3-10 years), and Longevity (10+ years).

Psychological & Tactical Guardrails

1. **Intentional Simplicity:** Aim for a "cheaper to run" retirement by reducing the structural complexity of your accounts.
2. **Decumulation Logic:** Shift from the "Accumulator" identity (saving) to the "Custodian" identity (intentional spending for utility).
3. **The Floor vs. The Ceiling:** Ensure "Floor" expenses (needs) are covered by stable sources; use the portfolio for "Ceiling" experiences (wants).
4. **Avoid Identity Drift:** Ensure your financial strategy serves your personal autonomy, not the other way around.
5. **Bracket Management:** Use the flexibility of "creating your own dividend" to stay below key thresholds for Medicare premiums and tax brackets.
6. **Total Return Harvesting:** Rebalance your portfolio by selling winners to provide cash, which keeps your target asset allocation in check.
7. **The "2-Suitcase" Principle:** Apply the logic of radical authenticity—only hold onto financial strategies and assets that provide genuine utility or joy.
8. **Antifragile Planning:** Build a system that benefits from volatility by having enough liquidity to ignore short-term market noise while the growth engine compounds.

Explain more on this: And then assume my historical gains is 12%, and inflation at 3%, will my safe withdrawal rate is 9%?

Why this works:
This math assumes a 4% withdrawal rate. If your portfolio earns an average of 7% (historical stock market average) and inflation is 3%, your "real" growth is

4%. By withdrawing exactly 4%, your principal remains theoretically "immortal"—it keeps up with inflation without ever being depleted.

This is one of the most dangerous traps in retirement planning. While the math looks clean on a spreadsheet, the short answer is: **No, a 9% withdrawal rate is not safe**, even if your average historical return is 12%.

To understand why, we have to look at the difference between **average returns** and **sequence of returns**, and why "The 4% Rule" exists in the first place.

---

1. The Variance Gap (Why "Average" is a Lie)

The stock market doesn't return 12% every year. It might return +30% one year and -20% the next.

- **During Accumulation:** Volatility is your friend (Dollar Cost Averaging).
- **During Decumulation:** Volatility is your enemy.

If you withdraw 9% during a year when the market is down 20%, you aren't just taking out "income"—you are amputating a massive chunk of your "principal engine." Because that money is gone, it cannot participate in the eventual recovery. This is called **Sequence of Returns Risk**.

---

2. Real Growth vs. Safe Withdrawal Rate (SWR)

The calculation you mentioned (

$$12\% - 3\% = 9\%$$

) defines **Real Return**, not a **Safe Withdrawal Rate**.

- **Real Return:** What the money does over a 30-year average.
- **Safe Withdrawal Rate:** The maximum you can take out annually while ensuring you don't hit $0 during a prolonged "down" cycle (like the 1970s or 2000s).

The original "4% Rule" (The Trinity Study) found that 4% was the "fail-safe" number. Even in the worst historical 30-year periods in US history, a 4% withdrawal rate (adjusted for inflation) never exhausted the principal. At a 9%

withdrawal rate, a single "lost decade" in the market would likely deplete your portfolio to zero within 12–15 years.

---

3. The "Immortal Principal" Equation

If you want your principal to be truly "immortal" (meaning you never touch the inflation-adjusted base), you generally cannot withdraw the full real return. You must leave a "safety margin" to buffer against the years where returns are negative.

The 12% Return Scenario

If you truly average 12% and inflation is 3%:

- **Real Return:** 9%.
- **Recommended Withdrawal:** 4% to 5%.
- **The "Buffer":** The remaining 4% stays in the account to "re-fill" the engine after market crashes.

---

4. Summary of the Conversation & 22-Point Updated Guidelines

We have clarified that **Real Return** and **Safe Withdrawal Rate** are not interchangeable. A high-performance retirement requires a "buffer" to survive volatility. We also reinforced that your principal engine needs to be protected from "amputation" during market downturns.

Updated 22-Point Protocol for Retirement Longevity

1. **Distinguish Return from SWR:** Never equate average real returns (

   $$Gain - Inflation$$

) with a safe withdrawal rate.
2. **Respect Volatility:** Understand that a 0% return year with a 9% withdrawal is a net -9% hit to your engine's future compounding power.

3. **The 4% Floor:** Treat 4% as the baseline for safety; anything above 5% significantly increases "probability of ruin."
4. **Sequence Risk Mastery:** Use your cash buffer to fund life during "down" years so you never sell equities at a loss.
5. **Total Return Focus:** (Carry over) Focus on the sum of growth and dividends, not just one or the other.
6. **Asset Location:** (Carry over) Keep high-growth assets in Roth and tax-efficient index funds in taxable accounts.
7. **Tax Lot Management:** When "creating your own dividend," sell the specific shares with the lowest gains first to minimize tax.
8. **The 25x Rule:** Maintain a minimum of 25x your annual spending gap as your "Safety Anchor."
9. **Inflation Protection:** Always factor in a 3%–4% "tax" by inflation that must remain in the principal to maintain purchasing power.
10. **The "Bucket" Strategy:** Use Stage A (Cash), Stage B (Core), and Stage C (Growth) to segment your risk.
11. **Dynamic Spending:** Be prepared to reduce your withdrawal % slightly during bear markets to protect the principal engine.
12. **The "Immortal" Margin:** Leave a portion of your "Real Return" in the account to act as a shock absorber.
13. **Avoid Yield Chasing:** Don't let the desire for "9% income" push you into risky, high-fee products (like certain private REITs or BDCs).
14. **Control the Calendar:** You decide when to harvest gains based on your tax bracket, not the fund manager’s schedule.
15. **Medicare Integration:** Be mindful that high withdrawals (even if "safe") can trigger IRMAA surcharges on Medicare.
16. **Legacy vs. Utility:** Decide if the "Immortal Principal" is for your consumption or for heirs; this dictates how aggressive your buffer needs to be.
17. **Low Expense Ratio:** High fees are a "permanent withdrawal" that provides zero utility. Keep fund costs near 0.05%.

18. **Rebalance with Purpose:** Use your annual rebalancing as the moment you "create your dividend."
19. **Psychological Flexibility:** Accept that "stable" doesn't mean "static." Your withdrawal dollar amount changes with inflation.
20. **The 2-Suitcase Life:** Minimize fixed costs to increase your "optionality" during lean market years.
21. **Radical Authenticity:** Your withdrawal rate should fund your *actual* life, not a lifestyle intended to impress others.
22. **Antifragile Mindset:** Build a portfolio that expects—and can survive—a 30% market drop without changing your daily standard of living.

Does your current plan include a specific "cash buffer" to handle those years when the market doesn't hit that 12% average?